

B”H

Why Did Moses Not Enter the Holy Land?

On the journey from slavery to freedom, the model of leadership must change

By Rabbi YY Jacobson

~*~

Dedicated by **Eda Schottenstein**

In honor of her husband **David**

winning the Ernst and Young Entrepreneur of the Year Award

~*~

Dedicated in loving memory of

Chana bas R' **Aharon Leib** Shlita

On the occasion of her Yartzzeit on the 9th of Tamuz.

Her grace and kindness brought joy to all

~*~

1. Class Summary

At last, the great moment had arrived. For forty years, the Jewish People had wandered together through the desert. The older generation had already passed on. Even beloved Miriam was no more. By now, under the leadership of Moses, the young nation of Israel was finally ready to enter the Promised Land. But an incident occurred that would transform the nation's destiny.

The people run out of water. They cry to Moses, who turns to G-d. G-d commands Moses to produce water from a rock miraculously, by speaking to it. Instead, Moses hits the rock twice, which indeed produces water. It is the most subtle and enigmatic 'sin' in the entire Torah, yet because of it Moses' greatest dream is shattered and he is denied entry into the Land of Israel.

If G-d instructed him to speak to the rock, why did he choose to strike it? Why was Moses punished so severely for this tiny little 'sin'? Does it really make a difference whether you communicate to a rock verbally or use force?

And what makes this story perhaps most perplexing is the fact that forty years earlier, an almost identical incident occurred. And in that instance, G-d had told Moses directly to strike the rock. What is the difference between these two events, from G-d's perspective, and from the nation's?

The answers to these questions will teach us profound truths about the Torah's view of leadership and education.

2. Sources:

מקורות:

1. Numbers, Chukas	1. במדבר, פ' חוקת
Chapter 20	פרק כ
1. The entire congregation of the children of Israel arrived at the desert of Zin in the first month, and the people settled in Kadesh. Miriam died there and was buried there.	(א) וַיָּבֹאוּ בְנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל כָּל הָעֵדָה מִדְּבַר צִן בַּחֹדֶשׁ הָרִאשׁוֹן וַיֵּשֶׁב הָעָם בְּקִדְשׁ וַתָּמָת שָׁם מִרְיָם וַתִּקָּבֵר שָׁם :
2. The congregation had no water; so they assembled against Moses and Aaron	(ב) וְלֹא הָיָה מַיִם לָעֵדָה וַיִּקְהָלוּ עַל מֹשֶׁה וְעַל אַהֲרֹן :
3. The people quarreled with Moses, and they said, "If only we had died with the death of our brothers before the Lord.	(ג) וַיִּרְבּוּ הָעָם עִם מֹשֶׁה וַיֹּאמְרוּ לֵאמֹר וְלוֹ גִּנְעֵנוּ בְּגֹועַ אַחִינוּ לִפְנֵי ה' :
4. "Why have you brought the congregation of the Lord to this desert so that we and our livestock should die there?	(ד) וְלָמָּה הֵבֵאתֶם אֶת קַהֲל ה' אֶל הַמִּדְבָּר הַזֶּה לָמוֹת שָׁם אֲנַחְנוּ וּבְעִירָנוּ :
5. "Why have you taken us out of Egypt to bring us to this evil place; it is not a place for seeds, or for fig trees, grapevines, or pomegranate trees, and there is no water to drink."	(ה) וְלָמָּה הֶעֱלִיתֵנוּ מִמִּצְרַיִם לְהֵבִיא אֶתְנוּ אֶל הַמָּקוֹם הַרָע הַזֶּה לֹא מְקוֹם זֵרַע וַתֵּאֲנָה וְגִפְיוֹן וְרִמּוֹן וּמִיִּם אֵין לְשָׁתוֹת :
6. Moses and Aaron moved away from the assembly to the entrance of the Tent of Meeting, and they fell on their faces. [Then] the glory of the Lord appeared to them.	(ו) וַיָּבֹאוּ מֹשֶׁה וְאַהֲרֹן מִפְּנֵי הַקָּהָל אֶל פֶּתַח אֹהֶל מוֹעֵד וַיִּפְּלוּ עַל פְּנֵיהֶם וַיֵּרָא כְבוֹד ה' אֲלֵיהֶם :
7. The Lord spoke to Moses, saying:	(ז) וַיְדַבֵּר ה' אֶל מֹשֶׁה לֵאמֹר :
8. "Take the staff and assemble the congregation, you and your brother Aaron, and <u>speak to the rock</u> in their presence so that it will give forth its water. You shall bring forth water for them from the rock and give the congregation and their livestock to drink."	(ח) קַח אֶת הַמַּטֵּה וְהִקְהַל אֶת הָעֵדָה אֹתָהּ וְאַהֲרֹן אַחֲיֶיךָ וְדַבַּרְתֶּם אֶל הַסֶּלַע לְעִינֵיהֶם וְנָתַן מִימֵיו וְהוֹצֵאתָ לָהֶם מַיִם מִן הַסֶּלַע וְהִשְׁקִיתָ אֶת הָעֵדָה וְאֶת בְּעִירָם :
9. Moses took the staff from before the Lord as He had commanded him.	(ט) וַיִּקַּח מֹשֶׁה אֶת הַמַּטֵּה מִלִּפְנֵי ה' כַּאֲשֶׁר צִוָּהוּ :
10. Moses and Aaron assembled the congregation in front of the rock, and he said to them, "Now listen, you rebels, can we draw water for you from this rock?"	(י) וַיִּקְהָלוּ מֹשֶׁה וְאַהֲרֹן אֶת הַקָּהָל אֶל פְּנֵי הַסֶּלַע וַיֹּאמְרוּ לָהֶם שְׁמְעוּ נָא הַמְּרִים הַמֶּן הַסֶּלַע הַזֶּה נוֹצֵיא לָכֶם מַיִם :
11. Moses raised his hand and <u>struck the rock with his staff twice</u> , when an abundance of water gushed forth, and the congregation and their livestock drank.	(יא) וַיִּרָם מֹשֶׁה אֶת יָדוֹ וַיַּךְ אֶת הַסֶּלַע בְּמַטְהוֹ פַּעַמַיִם וַיֵּצְאוּ מִיִּם רַבִּים וַתִּשְׁתְּ הָעֵדָה וּבְעִירָם :
12. The Lord said to Moses and Aaron, "Since you did	(יב) וַיֹּאמֶר ה' אֶל מֹשֶׁה וְאֶל אַהֲרֹן יַעַן לֹא

<p>not have faith in Me to sanctify Me in the eyes of the children of Israel, therefore you shall not bring this assembly to the Land which I have given them.</p> <p>13. These are the waters of dispute [Mei Merivah] where the children of Israel contended with the Lord, and He was sanctified through them.</p>	<p>הָאֱמָנָתָם בִּי לְהַקְדִּישֵׁנִי לְעֵינֵי בְנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל לָכֵן לֹא תָבִיאוּ אֶת הַקְּהָל הַזֶּה אֶל הָאָרֶץ אֲשֶׁר נָתַתִּי לָהֶם :</p> <p>(יג) הָמָּה מֵי מְרִיבָה אֲשֶׁר רָבוּ בְנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל אֶת ה' וַיִּקְדָּשׁ בָּם :</p>
<p>2. Exodus, Beshalach Chapter 17</p> <p>1. The entire community of the children of Israel journeyed from the desert of Sin to their travels by the mandate of the Lord. They encamped in Rephidim, and there was no water for the people to drink.</p> <p>2. So the people quarreled with Moses, and they said, "Give us water that we may drink Moses said to them, Why do you quarrel with me? Why do you test the Lord?"</p> <p>3. The people thirsted there for water, and the people complained against Moses, and they said, "Why have you brought us up from Egypt to make me and my children and my livestock die of thirst?"</p> <p>4. Moses cried out to the Lord, saying, "What shall I do for this people? Just a little longer and they will stone me!"</p> <p>5. And the Lord said to Moses, "Pass before the people and take with you [some] of the elders of Israel, and take into your hand your staff, with which you struck the Nile, and go.</p> <p>6. "Behold, I shall stand there before you on the rock in Horeb, <u>and you shall strike the rock</u>, and water will come out of it, and the people will drink." <u>Moses did so</u> before the eyes of the elders of Israel.</p> <p>7. He named the place Massah [testing] and Meribah [quarreling] because of the quarrel of the children of Israel and because of their testing the Lord, saying, Is the Lord in our midst or not?</p>	<p>2. שמות, פ' בשלח פרק יז</p> <p>(א) וַיִּסְעוּ כָּל עַדְת בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל מִמִּדְבַּר סִין לְמִסְעֵיהֶם עַל פִּי ה' וַיַּחֲנוּ בְּרֶפְדִּים וְאִין מַיִם לְשִׁתּוֹת הָעָם :</p> <p>(ב) וַיִּרְבּוּ הָעָם עִם מֹשֶׁה וַיֹּאמְרוּ תָנוּ לָנוּ מַיִם וְנִשְׁתֵּה וַיֹּאמֶר לָהֶם מֹשֶׁה מַה תִּרְיִבוּן עִמָּדִי מַה תִּנְסוּן אֶת ה' :</p> <p>(ג) וַיִּצְמָא שָׁם הָעָם לַמַּיִם וַיִּלְךְ הָעָם עַל מֹשֶׁה וַיֹּאמְרוּ לָמָּה זֶה הָעֲלִיתָנוּ מִמִּצְרַיִם לְהַמִּית אֹתֵינוּ וְאֶת בְּנֵינוּ וְאֶת מִקְנֵינוּ בַצִּמְאָה :</p> <p>(ד) וַיִּצְעַק מֹשֶׁה אֶל ה' לֵאמֹר מַה אֶעֱשֶׂה לָּעָם הַזֶּה עוֹד מֵעַט וְסִקְלֵנוּ :</p> <p>(ה) וַיֹּאמֶר ה' אֶל מֹשֶׁה עֲבֹר לִפְנֵי הָעָם וְקַח אֶתֶּךָ מִזִּקְנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל וּמַטֵּךְ אֲשֶׁר הִכִּיתָ בּוֹ אֶת הַיָּאֵר קַח בְּיָדְךָ וְהִלַּכְתָּ :</p> <p>(ו) הִנְנִי עֹמֵד לִפְנֶיךָ שָׁם עַל הַצּוּר בְּחָרֵב וְהִכִּיתָ בַּצּוּר וַיִּצְאוּ מִמֶּנּוּ מַיִם וְשָׁתָה הָעָם וַיַּעַשׂ כֵּן מֹשֶׁה לְעֵינֵי זִקְנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל :</p> <p>(ז) וַיִּקְרָא שָׁם הַמָּקוֹם מַסָּה וּמְרִיבָה עַל רִיב בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל וְעַל נִסְתָּם אֶת ה' לֵאמֹר הֲיֵשׁ ה' בְּקִרְבָּנוּ אִם אֵין :</p>
<p>3. Yalkut Shimoni Chukas, 763</p> <p>"Speak to the rock," do not strike it—</p> <p>G-d told Moses, 'when a lad is young, the educator may [at times] hit the child in order teach him. When the</p>	<p>3. ילקוט שמעוני פרשת חקת, רמז תשסג</p> <p>ודברתם אל הסלע, והכיתם לא נאמר, א"ל כשהנער קטן רבו מכהו ומלמדו כיוון</p>

<p>child grows into adulthood, however, the educator must rebuke him only verbally.</p> <p>Similarly, when the rock was but a 'small child,' I instructed you to strike it; but now [after 40 years when it has grown larger] you must only speak to it. Teach it a chapter of Torah and it will produce water.</p>	<p>שהגדיל בדבור הוא מיסרו, כך אמר הקב"ה למשה, כשהיה סלע זה קטן הכית אותו, שנאמר והכית בצור, אבל עכשיו ודברתם אל הסלע, שנה עליו פרק אחד והוא מוציא מים מן הסלע.</p>
<p>4. Kli Yakar Chukas, 20:8</p> <p>Even though it is not literally applicable to a stone, G-d is using this to demonstrate to us, that it is only proper to strike a very young and foolish child. However, once he matures, yelling must be replaced with explaining, because if he does not listen to verbal moral guidance and is still punished by force, undoubtedly as soon as he glimpses freedom he will revert to his folly.</p> <p>Just as the rock needed to be struck twice, and it did not 'listen' to the first hit, likewise any actions motivated by force and coercion, are not carried out swiftly.</p>	<p>4. כלי יקר במדבר כ, ח</p> <p>והראה לנו הקב"ה אע"פ שאין דבר זה שייך בסלע, מכל מקום למען הראותו הובאו הענינים הללו, לומר שאין נכון להכות בשבט כי אם לנער ובער, אבל כשיגדיל תחת גערה במבין, כי אם לא ישמע בקול מוסר ויהיה צריך להכאה ביסורין בלי ספק מיד כי יראה הרוחה יחזור לסורו.</p> <p>כמו שהוצרך להכות את הסלע פעמים ולא שמע להכאה ראשונה כך כל מה שנעשה ע"י הכאה והכרח אין המעשה נעשה מהרה.</p>
<p>צור = 296</p> <p>אלקים = אלף = 111 למ"ד = 74 ה"ה = 10 יר"ד = 20 מ"ם = 80 Total - 295</p>	<p>5 סלע = סמ"ד, למ"ד, עי"ן = מים</p> <p>סלע = 160</p> <p>יהו"ה = 5, 6, 5, 10 10 x 5 = 50 5 x 10 = 50 5 x 6 = 30 6 x 5 = 30 Total- 160</p>
<p>5. Deuteronomy, Ha'azinu Chapter 32, Verse 13</p> <p>13. He made them ride upon the high places of the earth, that they would eat the produce of the field. <u>He let them suck honey from a rock</u>, and oil from the mighty part of the crag.</p>	<p>5. דברים, פ' האזינו פרק לב, פסוק יג</p> <p>יג. יִרְכְּבוּהוּ עַל [במותר] בְּמַתֵּי אֲרָץ וַיֹּאכְל תְּנוּבוֹת שְׂדֵי וַיִּנְקְהוּ דָבֶשׁ מִסֶּלַע וַשְּׁמֶן מִחֲלֹמֵי־שׂוֹר.</p>

מקורות להשיעור:

- א. ילקוט שמעוני, חוקת, רמז תשסג.
- ב. כלי יקר חוקת כ, ח.
- ג. אור התורה לאדמו"ר הצמח צדק פרשת חוקת.
- ד. ספר המאמרים תרכ"ו, תר"ל ותרל"ב, לאדמו"ר מהר"ש, פרשת חוקת.
- ה. ספר המאמרים תרס"ט לאדמו"ר מוהרש"ב, פרשת חוקת.

Questions and Exercises

1. Why was Moses punished so severely for striking the rock?
2. Following the class, do you think Moses “sinned?” Was he “punished?”
3. Who had the deepest impact on your life, and what method did he or she employ?
4. Do you think most educators and parents today educate by “hitting” or “talking”; with the “stick” or with the “mouth?” How about yourself?
5. Which method of education do you find most effective with your own children or students?